# Perfect cliques and $G_{\delta}$ colorings of Polish spaces 

Wiesław Kubiś<br>Ben-Gurion University of the Negev, Beer-Sheva<br>Israel<br>and<br>University of Silesia, Katowice<br>Poland<br>E-mail: kubis@math.bgu.ac.il

July, 2001


#### Abstract

A coloring of a set $X$ is any subset $C$ of $[X]^{N}$, where $N>1$ is a natural number. We give some sufficient conditions for the existence of a perfect $C$-homogeneous set, in case where $C$ is $G_{\delta}$ and $X$ is a Polish space. In particular, we show that it is sufficient that there exist $C$-homogeneous sets of arbitrarily large countable Cantor-Bendixson rank. We apply our methods to show that an analytic subset of the plane contains a perfect 3 -clique if it contains any uncountable $k$-clique, where $k$ is a natural number or $\aleph_{0}$ (a set $K$ is a $k$-clique in $X$ if the convex hull of any of its $k$-element subsets is not contained in $X$ ).


2000 AMS Subject Classification: Primary: 52A37, 54H05, Secondary: 03E02, 52A10.
Keywords: Open $\left(G_{\delta}\right)$ coloring, perfect homogeneous set, clique.

## 1 Introduction

For a set $X$ and natural number $N,[X]^{N}$ denotes the collection of all $N$-element subsets of $X$. A (two-color) coloring of $X$ is (represented by) a set $C \subseteq[X]^{N}$. We identify $[X]^{N}$ with a suitable subspace of the product $X^{N}$. We are interested in the following problem: find sufficient conditions for the existence of a perfect $C$-homogeneous set $P \subseteq X$, where $X$ is a Polish space and $C \subseteq[X]^{N}$ is open (or more generally $G_{\delta}$ ). A natural example for this problem is the following: let $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{N}$ be closed and $C=\left\{s \in[X]^{k}\right.$ : conv $\left.s \nsubseteq X\right\}$. Then $C$ is open and a $C$-homogeneous set is called a $k$-clique in $X$. It is known (see [3]) that there exists a closed set $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{2}$ such that $X$ is not a countable union of convex sets but every $k$-clique in $X$ is countable for every $k<\omega$. On the other hand, it is proved in [3] that if a closed set $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{2}$ contains an uncountable $k$-clique for some $k$ then it contains a perfect 3-clique.
We prove that if $C$ is a $G_{\delta}$ coloring of a Polish space and there are no perfect $C$-homogeneous sets, then there is a countable ordinal $\gamma$ such that the Cantor-Bendixson rank of every $C$ homogeneous set is $<\gamma$. In the context of cliques, this strengthens the result of Kojman [2]
(see Theorem 3.1(a) below). From our result it follows that if $C$ is a $G_{\delta}$ coloring of an analytic space then either there exists a perfect $C$-homogeneous set or all $C$-homogeneous sets are countable. This is not true for $F_{\sigma}$ colorings: a result of Shelah [4] states that consistently there exist $F_{\sigma}$ 2-colorings with uncountable but not perfect homogeneous sets. Concerning cliques, we investigate analytic subsets of the plane. We prove that if an analytic set $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{2}$ contains an uncountable $\aleph_{0}$-clique then $X$ contains also a perfect 3 -clique.

### 1.1 Notation

Any subset of $[X]^{N}$ is called a coloring (or an $N$-coloring) of $X$. We write $\neg C$ instead of $[X]^{N} \backslash C$. A set $S \subseteq X$ is $C$-homogeneous if $[A]^{N} \subseteq C$. We identify $[X]^{N}$ with the subspace of $X^{N}$ consisting of all $N$-tuples $\left(x_{0}, \ldots, x_{N-1}\right)$ with $x_{i} \neq x_{j}$ for $i \neq j$. Thus we may consider topological properties of colorings. If $f: X \rightarrow Y$ is a function then we write $f[S]$ for the image of a set $S \subseteq X$ and $f(s)$ for the value at a point $s \in X$. By a perfect set we mean a compact, nonempty, topological space with no isolated points.

## 2 On colorings

First we recall a simple result on open 2-colorings of analytic spaces (see Todorčević-Farah's book [5, p. 81]). We present a proof for completeness.

Proposition 2.1. Let $X$ be an analytic space and let $C \subseteq[X]^{2}$ be open. Then either there exists a perfect $C$-homogeneous set or else $X$ is a countable union of $\neg C$-homogeneous sets, i.e. $X=\bigcup_{n \in \omega} A_{n}$ where $\left[A_{n}\right]^{2} \cap C=\emptyset$ for every $n \in \omega$.

Proof. Let $f: \omega^{\omega} \rightarrow X$ be continuous and onto $X$. Define

$$
C^{\prime}=\left\{s \in\left[\omega^{\omega}\right]^{2}: f[s] \in C\right\}
$$

Note that if $\{x, y\} \in C^{\prime}$ then $f(x) \neq f(y)$. Now observe that if $\omega^{\omega}$ is a union of countably many $\neg C^{\prime}$-homogeneous sets, then the same holds for $X$. Also, if $P$ is a compact, perfect, $C^{\prime}-$ homogeneous subset of $\omega^{\omega}$ then $f \upharpoonright P$ is one-to-one and hence $f[P]$ is a perfect $C$-homogeneous set. Thus we may assume that $X=\omega^{\omega}$ and that $X$ cannot be covered by countably many $\neg C$-homogeneous sets.
Let $V$ consist of all $x \in \omega^{\omega}$ such that some neighborhood of $x$ is a countable union of $\neg C$ homogeneous sets. By assumption, it follows that $V \neq \omega^{\omega}$. Let $B=\omega^{\omega} \backslash V$. Now we are working in $B$ : construct a tree $T=\left\{u_{s}: s \in 2^{<\omega}\right\}$ of open subsets of $B$ such that $T$ defines a Cantor set and $\{x, y\} \in C$ whenever $x \in u_{s}, y \in u_{t}$ and $s, t \in 2^{k}$ are distinct, $k<\omega$. Coming to split $u_{s}$, where $s \in 2^{k}$, we first find a pair $\{x, y\} \in\left[u_{s}\right]^{2} \cap C$ (this is possible since $u_{s}$ is not $\neg C$-homogeneous). Next, using the fact that $C$ is open, enlarge $x, y$ to open sets $u_{s \vee 0}, u_{s \vee 1}$, preserving $C$-homogeneity. The perfect set obtained from $T$ is evidently $C$-homogeneous.

The above result is no longer valid when we replace the word "open" with "closed", see [5, p. 83]. Also, the above proposition cannot be strengthened for colorings of triples: there exists a clopen 3-coloring of $2^{\omega}$ such that there are no uncountable homogeneous sets neither of this
color nor of its complement, see Blass' example [1]. In this example, the Cantor-Bendixson rank of any homogeneous set is at most 1 . Below we show that in this situation, there always exists a countable ordinal which bounds the Cantor-Bendixson ranks of all homogeneous sets. In fact this is true for $G_{\delta}$ colorings.
For a topological space $Y$ and an ordinal $\alpha$ we denote by $Y^{(\alpha)}$ the $\alpha$-derivative of $Y$; the Cantor-Bendixson rank of $Y$ is the minimal ordinal $\gamma$ such that $Y^{(\gamma+1)}$ is empty.

Theorem 2.2. Let $C$ be a $G_{\delta} N$-coloring of a Polish space $X$. If for every countable ordinal $\gamma$ there exists a C-homogeneous set of the Cantor-Bendixson rank $\geqslant \gamma$ then $X$ contains $a$ perfect $C$-homogeneous set.

Proof. Fix a countable base $\mathcal{B}$ in $X$ and fix a complete metric on $X$. Let $C=\bigcap_{n \in \omega} C_{n}$, where each $C_{n}$ is open and $C_{n+1} \subseteq C_{n}$. We will construct a tree of open sets $T=\left\{u_{s}: s \in 2^{<\omega}\right\}$ with the following properties:
(i) $\operatorname{cl} u_{s^{\wedge} i} \subseteq u_{s}, \operatorname{cl} u_{s} \cap \operatorname{cl} u_{t}=\emptyset$ if $s, t$ are incompatible and $\operatorname{diam}\left(u_{s}\right)<2^{-\operatorname{length}(s)}$;
(ii) if $k<\omega$ and $s_{0}, \ldots, s_{N-1} \in 2^{k}$ are pairwise distinct then

$$
\left\{x_{0}, \ldots, x_{N-1}\right\} \in C_{k}
$$

whenever $x_{i} \in u_{s_{i}}, i<N$;
(iii) if $k<\omega$ then for each $\gamma<\omega_{1}$ there exists a $C$-homogeneous set $P=P_{k, \gamma}$ such that $P^{(\gamma)} \cap u_{s} \neq \emptyset$ for each $s \in 2^{k}$.

We start with $u_{\emptyset}=X$. Suppose that $u_{s}$ has been defined for all $s \in 2^{\leqslant k}$. Fix $\gamma<\omega_{1}$ and consider $P=P_{k, \gamma+1}$, as in (iii). Then for each $s \in 2^{k}$ the set $P^{(\gamma)} \cap u_{s}$ is infinite. Fix $S \subseteq P^{(\gamma)}$ such that $\left|S \cap u_{s}\right|=2$ for each $s \in 2^{k}$. Next, enlarge each $x \in S \cap u_{s}$ to a small open set $v_{x} \in \mathcal{B}$, contained in $u_{s}$, such that $\left\{y_{0}, \ldots, y_{N-1}\right\} \in C_{k+1}$ whenever $y_{i}$ are taken from pairwise distinct $v_{x}$ 's. This is possible, because $C_{k+1}$ is open. Let $\varphi(\gamma)=\left\{v_{x}: x \in S\right\}$. This defines a mapping $\varphi: \omega_{1} \rightarrow[\mathcal{B}]^{<\omega}$. As $\mathcal{B}$ is countable, there is unbounded $F \subseteq \omega_{1}$ such that $\varphi \upharpoonright F$ is constant, say $\left\{v_{s^{\wedge} i}: s \in 2^{k}, i<2\right\}$, where $v_{s^{\wedge} i} \subseteq u_{s}$. Set $u_{s^{\wedge} i}=v_{s \wedge i}$. Observe that (i) holds if we let $v_{x}$ 's to be small enough. Also (ii) holds, by the definition of $v_{x}$ 's. Finally, (iii) holds, because $P_{k, \gamma+1}^{(\gamma)} \cap u_{t} \neq \emptyset$ for $t \in 2^{k+1}$ whenever $\gamma \in F$. By (ii) the perfect set obtained from this construction is $C$-homogeneous.

Using the above theorem and arguments from the proof of Proposition 2.1 we obtain the following (see Shelah [4, Remark 1.14]):

Corollary 2.3. Let $1 \leqslant N<\omega$ and let $C$ be a $G_{\delta} N$-coloring of an analytic space $X$. If there exists an uncountable $C$-homogeneous set then there exists also a perfect one.

## 3 Applications to convexity

Let $X \subseteq E$, where $E$ is a real vector space. A subset $K$ of $X$ is a $k$-clique ( $k$ can be a cardinal or just a natural number, we will use this notion for $k<\omega$ and $k=\aleph_{0}$ ) if conv $S \nsubseteq X$ whenever $S \in[K]^{k}$. If $E$ is finite-dimensional and $k>\operatorname{dim} E$ then we can define the notion of a strong $k$-clique replacing conv $S$ by int conv $S$ in the definition. A finite set $S \subseteq X$ is (strongly) defected in $X$ if conv $S \nsubseteq X$ (int conv $S \nsubseteq X$ ). It is clear that the relation of strong defectedness is open and defectedness is open provided that $X$ is closed.
Applying the results of the previous section we get the following:
Theorem 3.1. (a) Let $X$ be a closed set in a Polish linear space and let $N<\omega$. If $X$ does not contain a perfect $N$-clique then all $N$-cliques in $X$ are countable. Moreover, there exists an ordinal $\gamma<\omega_{1}$ which bounds the Cantor-Bendixson ranks of all $N$-cliques in $X$.
(b) Let $X$ be an analytic subset of $\mathbb{R}^{m}$. If $m<N<\omega$ and $X$ contains an uncountable strong $N$-clique then $X$ contains also a perfect one.

Theorem 3.1(a) was proved, under the stronger assumption that $X$ is a countable union of convex sets, by Kojman in [2].
In [3] we proved, in particular, that in a closed planar set either all cliques are countable or there exists a perfect 3 -clique. Here we prove the same for analytic sets, namely:

Theorem 3.2. Let $X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{2}$ be analytic. If $X$ contains an uncountable $\aleph_{0}$-clique then $X$ contains a perfect 3-clique.

Proof. Fix a continuous function $f: \omega^{\omega} \rightarrow X$ onto $X$ and fix an uncountable $\aleph_{0}$-clique $K \subseteq X$. We may assume that every line contains only countably many points of $L$ : otherwise, for some line $L, X \cap L$ contains an uncountable $\aleph_{0}$-clique, so it contains a perfect 2 -clique (Proposition 2.1), which is also a 3 -clique in $X$. Fix uncountable $K^{\prime} \subseteq \omega^{\omega}$ such that $f \upharpoonright K^{\prime}$ is a bijection onto $K$.
A finite collection $\left\{u_{0}, \ldots, u_{k-1}\right\}$ of open subsets of $\omega^{\omega}$ will be called relevant if each $u_{i}$ contains uncountably many points of $K^{\prime}, \operatorname{cl} u_{i} \cap \operatorname{cl} u_{j}=\emptyset$ whenever $i<j<k$ and

$$
\operatorname{int} \operatorname{conv}\left\{f\left(x_{0}\right), f\left(x_{1}\right), f\left(x_{2}\right)\right\} \nsubseteq X
$$

whenever $x_{0}, x_{1}, x_{2}$ are taken from pairwise distinct $u_{i}$ 's. To find a perfect 3 -clique in $X$, it suffices to construct a perfect tree of open sets in $\omega^{\omega}$ with relevant levels. If $P$ is a perfect set obtained from such a tree then $f \upharpoonright P$ is one-to-one and $f[P]$ is a perfect strong 3-clique.
Suppose that we have a relevant collection $\left\{u_{0}, \ldots, u_{k}\right\}$. We have to show that it is possible to split each $u_{i}$ to obtain again a relevant collection. We will split $u_{k}$. Let $L=K^{\prime} \cap u_{k}$ and pick $y_{i} \in u_{i}$ for $i<k$. Define $c_{i}:[L]^{2} \rightarrow 2$ by letting $c_{i}\left(x_{0}, x_{1}\right)=1$ iff $\operatorname{conv}\left\{f\left(x_{0}\right), f\left(x_{1}\right), f\left(y_{i}\right)\right\} \nsubseteq X$. Observe that there are no infinite $c_{i}$-homogeneous sets of color 0 : if $S \subseteq L$ is infinite then, by Carathéodory's theorem, there is $s \in[S]^{3}$ such that $f[s]$ is defected in $X$ (because $f[S]$ is defected) and hence for some $x_{0}, x_{1} \in s$ we have $\operatorname{conv}\left\{f\left(x_{0}\right), f\left(x_{1}\right), f\left(y_{i}\right)\right\} \nsubseteq X$, because $\operatorname{conv} T \subseteq \bigcup_{x, y \in T} \operatorname{conv}\{x, y, p\}$ for $T \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{2}, p \in \mathbb{R}^{2}$. Using $k$ times the theorem of DushnikMiller we obtain uncountable $L^{\prime} \subseteq L$ which is $c_{i}$-homogeneous of color 1 for $i<k$. Shrinking $L^{\prime}$ we may assume that each nonempty open subset of $L^{\prime}$ is uncountable. Now choose disjoint
open sets $v_{0}, v_{1}$ with $\operatorname{cl} v_{j} \subseteq u_{k}$ and $v_{j} \cap L^{\prime} \neq \emptyset$ for $j<2$. To finish the proof we need the following geometric property of the plane:

Claim 3.3. Let $A, B \subseteq X \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{2}$ and $c \in \mathbb{R}^{2}$ be such that $A, B$ are uncountable, each line contains countably many points of $A \cup B$ and $\operatorname{conv}\{a, b, c\} \nsubseteq X$ whenever $a \in A, b \in B$. Then there are $a_{0} \in A, b_{0} \in B$ such that int $\operatorname{conv}\left\{a_{0}, b_{0}, c\right\} \nsubseteq X$.

Proof. Suppose this is not true. Observe that, replacing $A$ and $B$ if necessary, we may assume that for some $b_{0} \in B,\left[a, b_{0}\right] \cup[a, c] \nsubseteq X$ whenever $a \in A$. Indeed, if $[b, c] \subseteq X$ for some $b \in B$ then we take $b_{0}=b$, otherwise we take any $a_{0} \in A$ and we replace $A$ and $B$. Now, without loss of generality, we may assume that $b_{0}=(-1,0), c=(1,0)$ and $A$ is contained in $(-1,1) \times(0,1)$. Now, if some vertical line contains two elements of $A$ then we are done: we take $a_{0} \in A$ such that some $a_{1} \in A$ is below $a_{0}$, then the relative interiors of segments $\left[b_{0}, a_{1}\right]$, $\left[c, a_{1}\right]$ are contained in the interior of $\operatorname{conv}\left\{a_{0}, b_{0}, c\right\}$.
Assume that each vertical line contains at most one element of $A$. As $A$ is uncountable, there is $a_{1} \in A$ such that arbitrarily close to $a_{1}$ there are uncountably many points both on the left and the right side of $a_{1}$. Suppose now that e.g. $\left\{b_{0}, a_{1}\right\}$ is defected in $X$. As $\left[b_{0}, a_{1}\right]$ contains only countably many points of $A$, we can find $a_{2} \in A$ which is close enough to $a_{1}$, on the left side of $a_{1}$ and not in $\left[b_{0}, a_{1}\right]$. If $a_{2}$ is below $\left[b_{0}, a_{1}\right]$ then we can set $a_{0}=a_{1}$, otherwise we can set $a_{0}=a_{2}$.

Let $i=0$. Using Claim 3.3 for $A=f\left[v_{0} \cap L^{\prime}\right], B=f\left[v_{1} \cap L^{\prime}\right]$ and $c=f\left(y_{i}\right)$ we get $x_{j} \in v_{j}$ such that int conv $\left\{f\left(x_{0}\right), f\left(x_{1}\right), f\left(y_{i}\right)\right\} \nsubseteq X$. By continuity, shrink $v_{0}, v_{1}$ and enlarge $y_{i}$ to an open set $u_{i}^{\prime} \subseteq u_{i}$ such that each triple selected from $f\left[v_{0}\right] \times f\left[v_{1}\right] \times f\left[u_{i}^{\prime}\right]$ is (strongly) defected in $X$. Repeat the same argument for each $i<k$, obtaining a relevant collection $\left\{u_{0}^{\prime}, \ldots, u_{k-1}^{\prime}, v_{0}^{\prime}, v_{1}^{\prime}\right\}$ which realizes the splitting of $u_{k}$. This completes the proof.

Actually, we have proved that if an analytic planar set $X$ contains any uncountable $\aleph_{0}$-clique then either $X$ contains a perfect strong 3 -clique or else, $X \cap L$ contains a perfect 2 -clique for some line $L$.

## References

[1] A. Blass, A partition theorem for perfect sets, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 82 (1981) 271-277.
[2] M. Kojman, Cantor-Bendixson degrees and convexity in $\mathbb{R}^{2}$, Israel J. Math. 121 (2001) 85-91.
[3] S. Geschke, M. Kojman, W. Kubiś, R. Schipperus, Convex decompositions in the plane and continuous pair colorings of the irrationals, submitted.
[4] S. Shelah, Borel sets with large squares, Fund. Math. 159 (1999) 1-50.
[5] S. Todorchevich, I. Farah, Some Applications of the Method of Forcing, Yenisei, Moscow 1995.

